



WEB SITE CRITIQUE SCORESHEET

Web Site Name: The Roundup

Site URL: <http://www.jesuitroundup.org>

School: Jesuit College Prep

City/State: Dallas/TX

PART ONE: COVERAGE & CONTENT

A good multimedia site can't survive on flashy graphics and cool video alone. It needs to have substance — good, solid content. And just as with a print publication, it needs to serve its readers, which may go beyond the traditional newspaper readership: students, faculty, staff, alumni, parents, prospective students, community members and even people who land on the site from a Web search.

Students, advisers and judges should consider these criteria when judging quality of work:

- Coverage is comprehensive, focusing on many aspects of the high school community it serves, including academics, school activities, faculty and administration and student affairs.
- The site includes Web-exclusive content, such as blogs, interactive elements, video, audio and breaking news.
- Coverage reflects the diversity of the school population and aims to be inclusive.
- Content is well coordinated, with different media contributing different parts of the story rather than repeating the same information.
- Stories are thoroughly reported; multiple points of view are represented.
- Coverage is accurate, fair and balanced.
- Writing is engaging, informative, to the point.
- Opinion pieces, including columns, editorials and blogs, cover issues and events of interest to the school community.
- Opinion pieces are well researched and well argued, citing factual evidence to support views expressed.
- Special reports and in-depth coverage is well planned and includes multimedia components.
- The site maximizes the capabilities of the Web, making use of multiple media and interactivity.
- Controversial issues are included and reported thoroughly.
- All stories, except for editorials, opinion columns, blogs and analysis pieces, are free of the writer's opinions.
- Headlines, captions and teasers are accurate and engaging, drawing readers into the material.
- The site demonstrates a spirit of experimentation by taking risks and trying new things.

Judge's Comments on Coverage & Content

Strengths:

Your coverage is outstanding! The variety of articles demonstrates your extensive efforts at being inclusive of your school population. The content is organized and coordinated in an effective way which draws the viewer into your site. Although the content on the homepage seems to be primarily sports, I am assuming that this content changes (not sure if this is your "headlines" section or if it is chosen by the editors?). I absolutely LOVE the name "Viewpoint" for your opinion section; these articles are interesting and relate to your population well. The "Viewpoint Archive" is impressive! Good use of appropriate risk-taking via controversial topics.

Weaknesses/Recommendations:

There is a significant amount of content on the homepage. I like that there are only 5 sections to your site, but I wonder if some of the great content on your homepage is getting lost due to the scrolling that is required to view these. I'd recommend you move the "Series" into a section or perhaps have "keywords" to describe where this content might be found within the site. I also noticed that "Profiles" is included within your "Most Recent" section; is this a section that could be added to the navigation bar? Just an idea.

SCORE FOR COVERAGE & CONTENT (use increments of 10)

0	300	500	800	1,000
Poor	Fair	Average	Very Good	Excellent

TOTAL POINTS:

880

MARK OF DISTINCTION (A mark of distinction is given by a judge or an NSPA official for exemplary work in this area. Cite reason below.)

For:

A wealth of content provided, updated often, interesting topics with great substance.

PART TWO: INTERACTIVITY & COMMUNITY

Interactivity is an essential element of 21st century journalism. It's no longer simply about giving information to the reader; it's about creating a dialogue between the publication and its readers.

Students, advisers and judges should consider these criteria when judging quality of work:

- Readers are able to interact with the publication in numerous ways, which may include comment functions, discussion boards and polls.
- Social networking and community tools, such as links to other information and guides to community services, are used to empower the reader.
- Games, polls, quizzes, interactive maps and other interactive tools are used to engage the reader with the news.
- Readers are invited to submit story ideas and given a way (either a story submission form or an e-mail address) to do so.
- Contact information is provided for readers who want to write a letter to the editor, buy an ad or contact the adviser and staff.
- The publication makes use of reader-generated content, which may include stories, photos and videos.
- Links on stories direct readers to other sites with useful and credible information that enhances the story.

Judge's Comments on Interactivity & Community

Strengths:

Site includes social media connections: Facebook, Twitter, RSS, and YouTube. Audience can submit articles using a Google Form. Social media is updated often / used regularly.

Weaknesses/Recommendations:

Consider extending your social media to include Instagram. You have great photos to share! Do you offer submissions from community members and parents? I noticed that the Google Form for submitting articles is locked down to internal submissions only. Just something to consider, as this could help grow your audience and reach more readers/subscribers.

SCORE FOR INTERACTIVITY & COMMUNITY (use increments of 10)

0	300	500	800	1,000
Poor	Fair	Average	Very Good	Excellent

TOTAL POINTS: **830**

MARK OF DISTINCTION (A mark of distinction is given by a judge or an NSPA official for exemplary work in this area. Cite reason below.)

For:

Social media is used extensively and updated often.

PART THREE: BREAKING NEWS

Since high school print publications generally come out infrequently, the Web offers students the opportunity to report important news events in a timely manner. Online student publications may be updated on a daily basis, even if the print edition only comes out a few times a year.

Students, advisers and judges should consider these criteria when judging quality of work:

- The site is updated regularly, daily if possible.
- Important news events are reported in a timely way.
- Multiple media — which may include photos, graphics, text, audio, video and interactive elements — are used to report breaking news events.
- Breaking news reports are updated as information comes in.
- News is covered in a fair and balanced manner.
- Coverage includes useful information for readers, such as notification of school closing in the event of bad weather or an emergency.
- News coverage includes stories of interest to the school community.
- Coverage of national and international events is related to the school community.
- News is accurate, even if the information is incomplete.

Judge's Comments on Breaking News

Strengths:

Site is updated often. "Most Recent" section does a great job of populating new content. I commemorate your efforts at publishing balanced content; it's not all the same topic (such as sports).

Weaknesses/Recommendations:

Consider adding a "Breaking News" or similar section of your site. Do you have a way of adding an important headline/announcement, such as school closing or emergency alert?

SCORE FOR BREAKING NEWS (use increments of 10)

0	150	250	400	500
Poor	Fair	Average	Very Good	Excellent

TOTAL POINTS: 420

MARK OF DISTINCTION (A mark of distinction is given by a judge or an NSPA official for exemplary work in this area. Cite reason below.)

For:

PART FOUR: DESIGN & NAVIGATION

A Web site should be attractive and easy to navigate, steering the reader toward the newest and most important information. Content should drive design, not the other way around.

Students, advisers and judges should consider these criteria when judging quality of work:

- The site is visually appealing, drawing readers into stories.
- Navigation is easy; readers can effortlessly find what they are looking for.
- The home page is simple and uncluttered.
- The site provides links to relevant resources, such as the high school Web site.
- A dominant piece of art, at least twice as big as anything else, anchors each page.
- Visual elements, such as photos and graphics, are used to enhance content, not as decoration.
- News is presented in a clear hierarchy, with the most important and/or newest stories prominently displayed.
- Tabs clearly direct readers to different sections of the publication, such as news, sports, entertainment and opinion.
- Multiple elements of a story are packaged together into an integrated unit.
- Bullets, fonts, boxes and other design elements are used to facilitate reading and navigation.
- Links provide access to related content on the site.

Judge's Comments on Design & Navigation

Strengths:

Site is published using WordPress, but you do a great job of establishing consistency throughout all articles/pages. The navigation is easy to follow and the clean, crisp look of your site makes it appear incredibly professional. The heading/logo is the perfect size. Text is easy to read and the font choice works well with the colors and design. I appreciate all of the useful links you've provided to your users at the top and bottom of the page; what a great way to keep your readers returning to your site. AWESOME mobile site, as well! The mobile version includes all of the content and is published in a user-friendly manner.

Weaknesses/Recommendations:

The article font appears to be a bit too large; this requires a lot of scrolling. Consider reducing the size, but only slightly. Add a "home" button to your navigation panel.

SCORE FOR DESIGN & NAVIGATION (use increments of 10)

0	300	500	800	1,000
Poor	Fair	Average	Very Good	Excellent

TOTAL POINTS: **950**

MARK OF DISTINCTION (A mark of distinction is given by a judge or an NSPA official for exemplary work in this area. Cite reason below.)

For:

Beautiful, professional site that is consistent throughout.

PART FIVE: RICH MEDIA

Multimedia offers a rich experience for readers that taps multiple senses. New media is constantly changing, and innovation should be a vital element of any Web site. Student sites, in particular, which are less bound by convention and market pressures, should be creative and pioneering.

Students, advisers and judges should consider these criteria when judging quality of work:

- The site uses a variety of media, which may include audio, video, slide shows and/or audio slide shows, text and graphics.
- Media are used to enhance content and help tell stories rather than simply add flashy elements to the site.
- Each media element — slide show, video, podcast, etc. — tells a story.
- Photos and video are adequately lit and well composed.
- Photo illustrations are clearly labeled.
- In photos and video, a variety of shots — action, candid, long shots, close-ups and detail shots — are used.
- In audio and video reports, sound quality is clear; voices are easy to understand.
- Audio reports make use of ambient and natural sound as well as interviews.
- Graphics are clear and easy to understand.
- Special projects and packages are well organized and designed to help readers navigate through the content.
- Copyright laws are understood and respected; only original content or copyright-free material (music, photos, videos, etc.) is used.

Judge's Comments on Rich Media

Strengths:

Outstanding photography, even though I recognize that only 10% of your photography is obtained by your staff. Effective use of slideshows to broaden your content for your readers. The "Media" section includes significant YouTube content, which many users prefer.

Weaknesses/Recommendations:

Video and Audio content has not been updated in quite some time (September 2015). I encourage you to provide more video/multimedia content to allow greater personalization to your site.

SCORE FOR RICH MEDIA (use increments of 10)

0	150	250	400	500
Poor	Fair	Average	Very Good	Excellent

TOTAL POINTS: **300**

MARK OF DISTINCTION (A mark of distinction is given by a judge or an NSPA official for exemplary work in this area. Cite reason below.)

For:

STUDENT WORK CREDIT

25	Site Design (25 possible points)
25	Writing/Editing (25 possible points)
3	Photography (25 possible points)
0	Art/Graphics/Multimedia (25 possible points)
53	TOTAL POINTS (100 possible)

200 FREQUENCY OF UPDATE CREDIT

Multiple times per day: 200 points
 Once per day: 200 points
 2-4 times/week: 150 points
 Once/week: 100 points
 Less: 0 points

JUDGE'S SUMMARY COMMENTS:

This is an absolutely outstanding publication. I commemorate your efforts at establishing and maintaining such a professional, well-developed and updated website. You should be very proud of your work on this! I noted some recommendations throughout this critique; my #1 would certainly be to publish more multimedia content. It would also be cool to see interactive polls. Thank you for the opportunity to see your site; I'll definitely be bookmarking it so I can keep an eye on all of the great news happening within your community.

TOTAL SCORE

> 3,633

MARKS OF DISTINCTION

- Coverage/Content
- Interactivity/Community
- Breaking News
- Design/Navigation
- Rich Media

HONOR RATING

- All-American
3,400 or more points
plus four or five Marks of Distinction
- First Class
3,400 or more points
- Second Class
3,399-2,150 points
- Third Class
2,149 or fewer points

JUDGE

> T. Shepard



Scoresheet © Copyright 2009
 NATIONAL SCHOLASTIC
 PRESS ASSOCIATION
 2221 University Ave SE
 Suite 121
 Minneapolis, MN 55414
 612-625-8335
 info@studentpress.org
 nspa.studentpress.org